## **Emissions Reductions Cost-Effectiveness** Paragraphs (d)(1) and (d)(8) Paragraphs (d)(1) and (d)(8) 5,123 HHs constructed w/traditional fireplaces (from page 1) 5,123 HHs constructed w/traditional fireplaces 0.28 avg cords per HH (ARB, 1997) 2,500 incremental cost to install EPA Phase II-certified unit (SMAQMD, 2006) 1,400 avg kgs per cord (Houck, 2006) 500 incremental cost to install dedicated NG unit (SMAQMD, 2006) 392 avg kgs of wood burned per HH 400 incremental cost to install electric unit (SMAQMD, 2006) 512 10% of HHs installing EPA Phase II-certified (estimate) 1,280,750 capital costs for US EPA Phase II-certified wood burning device 4,355 85% of HHs installing dedicated NG unit (estimate) 2,177,275 capital costs for natural gas 256 5% of HHs installing electric unit (estimate) 102,460 capital cost for electric unit 6.29 reductions (grams/kg) from installing EPA Phase II-certified 3,560,485 Total capital costs 12 reductions (grams/kg) from installing natural gas appliance 13 reductions (grams/kg) from installing electric unit 0 O&M costs presumed to be equivalent to existing non-compliant technology 1,263 kgs reduced from HHs with EPA Phase II-certified 12.50 present value factor (5% interest rate) 20,484 kgs reduced from HHs with NG unit 1,305 kgs reduced from HHs with electric unit 63.5 annual emission reductions 23,052 Annual kgs of PM reduction 25.36 Annual tons PM reduced from standards for new construction. $K + (O&M \times [PVF])$ 3,560,485 Emission Reductions x 20 years 1270 0.73 Discount factor for wood burning fireplaces not used 18.5 Adjusted annual tons PM reduced from new construction 3,560,485 \$ annual costs 1270 20 years of ER 45 Annual tons of PM reduction from wood burning prohibitions Cost effectiveness 2,803 \$ per ton PM reduced 63.5 Total tons PM reduction per year

# **Emissions Reductions** Cost-Effectiveness Paragraphs (d)(6) and (d)(8) Paragraphs (d)(6) and (d)(8) 250 commercial traditional fireplaces (estimate) 250 commercial traditional, uncontrolled fireplaces (estimate) 1,400 avg kgs of wood burned per commercial fireplace<sup>1</sup> 3,600 incremental cost to install EPA Phase II-certified unit (Houck, 2006a) 2,940 high-range kgs of wood burned per commercial fireplace<sup>2</sup> 3,200 incremental cost to install dedicated NG unit (Houck, 2006a) 125 50% replaced with EPA Phase II-certified units 450,000 capital costs for US EPA Phase II-certified wood burning device 125 50% replaced with dedicated NG units 400,000 capital costs for natural gas 6.29 reductions (grams/kg) from installing EPA Phase II-certified 850,000 Total capital costs 12 reductions (grams/kg) from installing dedicated NG unit 0 O&M costs presumed to be equivalent to existing non-compliant technology 1,101 reductions (kgs) from replacement with EPA Phase II-certified 2,100 reductions (kgs) from replacement with dedicated NG units 12.50 present value factor (5% interest rate) 3,201 Total kgs of PM reduction 1.6 annual emission reductions 3.5 Total tons of PM reduction (2007-2009) 1.2 Annual tons of PM reduction for avg wood usage 2.5 Annual tons of PM reduction for high-range wood usage $K + (O&M \times [PVF])$ 850,000 Emission Reductions x 20 years 0.4 Annual tons of PM reduction from burning prohibitions 850,000 \$ annual costs 31 20 years of ER 1.6 Total tons PM reduction per year for avg wood usage 2.9 Total tons PM reduction per year for high-range wood usage CE for avg wood usage 27,008 \$ per ton PM reduced CE for high-range wood usage Notes: 14,167 \$ per ton PM reduced (3.5 kgs/hr \* 5 hrs/day \* 80 days/season) (3.5 kgs/hr \* 7 hrs/day \* 120 days/season)

### **Emissions Reductions**

### Paragraph (d)(9)

- 0.95 avg cords per wood heater (Houck, 2006)
- 1,400 avg kgs per cord (Houck, 2006)
- 1,330 avg kgs of wood burned per wood heater
- 27,414 number of non-cert. wood heaters in Riv/SB (Houck, 2006)
  - 0.1 percentage of annual property transfers (SJVUAPCD, 2004)
- 2,741 annual property transfers
  - 0.7 percent. replacing non-certified with certified wood htrs (est.)
  - 0.2 percentage replaced with dedicated NG unit (estimate)
  - 0.1 percentage removed/rendered inoperative (estimate)
- 1,919 HHs installing EPA-Phase II certified
- 548 HHs installing dedicated NG unit
- 274 HHs removing wood heaters or rendering inoperable
- 6.29 reductions (grams/kg) from installing EPA Phase II-certified
- 12 reductions (grams/kg) from installing dedicated NG unit
- 13 reductions (grams/kg) from removing/rendering inoperative
- 16,054 annual reductions (kgs) replacing non-EPA certified wood htrs
- 8,751 annual reductions (kgs) from installing dedicated NG unit
- 4,740 annual reductions (kgs) from removing/rendering inoperative
- 29,544 Total kgs of PM reduction
  - 32 Annual tons PM reduced from property transfer
  - 0.92 Discount factor for wood heaters not used
  - 30 Total tons PM reduction per year beginning in 2013

### **Cost-Effectiveness**

### Paragraph (d)(9)

- 1,919 HHs installing EPA-Phase II certified
- 548 HH installing dedicated NG unit
- 274 HHs removing wood heaters or rendering inoperable
- 3,600 incremental cost to install EPA Phase II-certified unit (Houck, 2006a)
- 3,200 incremental cost to install dedicated NG unit (Houck, 2006a)
  - 500 cost to remove/render inoperative
- 6,908,328 capital costs for US EPA Phase II-certified wood burning device
- 1,754,496 capital costs for dedicated NG unit
  - 137,070 capital costs to remove/render inoperative
- 8,799,894 Total capital costs

V . (00M.: (D) (E)

- 0 O&M costs presumed to be equivalent to existing non-compliant technology
- 12.50 present value factor (5% interest rate)
  - 30 annual emission reductions

K + (Ualvix[PVF])	=	6,799,694	+ 0	
Emission Reductions x 20 years		598		
	=	8,799,894 \$	annual costs	
		598 20	years of ER	

Cost effectiveness = 14,716 \$ per ton PM reduced

0.700.004